

REPORT TO: Cabinet Member – Technical Services

DATE: 22 September 2010

SUBJECT: Revenue Expenditure, Capital Programme and Performance – 2009/10 Portfolio Final Accounts

WARDS AFFECTED: None directly

REPORT OF: Peter Moore
Environment & Technical Services Director
Andy Wallis
Planning and Economic Development Director
John Farrell
Interim Head of Corporate Finance & Information Services

CONTACT OFFICER: Kevin McBlain – 0151-934 4049
Dave Gant – 0151- 934 2378

EXEMPT/CONFIDENTIAL: No

PURPOSE/SUMMARY:

To notify the Cabinet Member of the final 2009/10 outturn position for the Technical Services Portfolio.

REASON WHY DECISION REQUIRED:

To allow the Cabinet Member to consider whether there are any issues arising from the 2009/10 accounts for the portfolio which should be referred to the Overview and Scrutiny Committee (Regeneration and Environmental).

RECOMMENDATIONS:

The Cabinet Member is asked to:

- i) Note the Portfolio's revenue expenditure outturn for 2009/10;
- ii) Note the impact of the Portfolio's capital expenditure outturn for 2009/10;
- iii) Note the Portfolio's actual performance indicators and data for 2009/10; and
- iv) Consider whether any issues should be referred to the Overview and Scrutiny Committee (Regeneration and Environmental) for consideration.

KEY DECISION: No

FORWARD PLAN: Not appropriate

IMPLEMENTATION DATE:

ALTERNATIVE OPTIONS:

None

IMPLICATIONS:**Budget/Policy Framework:****Financial:**

This report identifies a revenue budget overspend of £0.324m for 2009/10 for this Portfolio, which has been met from general balances of the Council. Actual capital expenditure against the Capital Programme has resulted in a rephasing of £0.940m of expenditure into 2010/11.

	2009/10 £	2010/11 £	2011/12 £	2012/13 £
CAPITAL EXPENDITURE				
Gross Increase in Capital Expenditure				
Funded by:				
Sefton Capital Resources				
Specific Capital Resources				
REVENUE IMPLICATIONS				
Gross Increase in Revenue Expenditure				
Funded by:				
Sefton funded Resources				
Funded from External Resources				
Does the External Funding have an expiry date? Y/N	When?			
How will the service be funded post expiry?				

Legal: Not appropriate

Risk Assessment: Not appropriate

Asset Management: Not appropriate

CONSULTATION UNDERTAKEN/VIEWS

FD 492 - The Interim Head of Corporate Finance and Information Services Finance has been consulted and his comments have been incorporated into this report.

CORPORATE OBJECTIVE MONITORING:

<u>Corporate Objective</u>		<u>Positive Impact</u>	<u>Neutral Impact</u>	<u>Negative Impact</u>
1	Creating a Learning Community		√	
2	Creating Safe Communities		√	
3	Jobs and Prosperity		√	
4	Improving Health and Well-Being		√	
5	Environmental Sustainability		√	
6	Creating Inclusive Communities		√	
7	Improving the Quality of Council Services and Strengthening local Democracy	√		
8	Children and Young People		√	

LIST OF BACKGROUND PAPERS RELIED UPON IN THE PREPARATION OF THIS REPORT

1 Introduction

- 1.1 The Audit and Governance Committee considered, and approved for audit, the Council's full Statement of Accounts on 30 June 2010. This report outlines the 2009/10 revenue and capital outturn for the Technical Services Portfolio and identifies the major variations. The report also contains details of the Portfolio's operational performance in 2009/10 against its relevant indicators, together with comments by the Technical Services Director, highlighting any issues that have ongoing implications for future years.
- 1.2 A separate report will be presented to the appropriate Overview and Scrutiny Committee to allow an independent to allow an independent review of all Portfolios' outturn positions.

2 Revenue Expenditure 2009/10

- 2.1 The closure of the 2009/10 Revenue Accounts has now been completed, however the detail is still subject to examination by the auditors PricewaterhouseCoopers. The outturn for the Council indicates that General Fund Balances will increase (when compared to the budgeted position) to £3.661m, owing to an overall net underspend of £0.021m. This net position has been achieved via the utilisation of one-off resources in order to minimize the impact of significant spending pressures experienced during the year,
- 2.2 The final outturn position for this portfolio, when compared to the 2009/10 Revenue Budget, indicates a net overspend of £0.324m. The key issues were reported in detail to Members during the course of the year.
- 2.3 **Annex A** summarises the divisions of service provided by this Portfolio and compares the adjusted original estimates with provisional outturn figures. The main variations within the net over spend are analysed below.

	Budget Variations
	£ m
a) Winter Maintenance	0.213
b) Car Parking Income	0.429
c) Highways Maintenance	-0.750
d) Residual Income Budgets	0.382
e) Other Net Variations	0.050
NET OVERSPEND FOR THE PORTFOLIO	<u>0.324</u>

This overspend of £0.324m represents 1.86% of the Portfolio's 2009/10 Revenue Budget to help mitigate the overspend one off reserves of £0.289m were utilised.

2.4 The Environment & Technical Services Director and the Planning and Economic Regeneration Director comment on the above, as follows:

- a) In respect of the Winter Maintenance Overspend (£0.213m) gritting of the Highway, both carriageways and footways, is a statutory duty hence expenditure has to be incurred as required. Despite a mild start to the Gritting Season the savings of this period were more than offset by severe weather throughout December and at the start of 2010.
- b) Car Parking Income has underachieved against budget (£0.429m) for a number of reasons mainly due to reduced demand for parking due to the extremely severe weather conditions experienced in the final quarter of the financial year and the continued impact of the recession as a result of which free parking promotions have been provided to encourage the use of local shopping areas. Parking levels were over 30% lower than the norm during this period. Action to address this has been taken and the Kew Park and Ride Service ceased in late February 2010 and the site was mothballed.
- c) Reductions of -£0.750m were achieved in general spending on highways maintenance due to the Council's spending freeze and also to contribute to reducing the potential overspend.
- d) As part of the 2007/08 accounts and 2008/09 budgets monitoring it was identified that the Department had income budgets, which could not be achieved. The 2009/10 budget allowed for significant growth to address this but finalising the budgets to take account of the Major Service Review has resulted in a shortfall of income against budget of £382k, the Department had transferred its main income generating service to Capita Symonds it was not possible to generate further income to offset the expected shortfall. Management of this issue in the longer term is currently being considered. (See paragraph 5.1.iii)

3 Capital Expenditure 2009/10

- 3.1 The Technical Services Portfolio Capital Programme for 2009/10 was £7.681m compared to an estimate of £8.621m, resulting in a net re-phasing of expenditure of £0.940m into later years. The schemes managed by this portfolio are shown in **Annex B**
- 3.2 The Environment and Technical Services Director comments on the variations are as follows: - the Integrated Transport Programme (£0.766m) The slippage in 2009/10 was due to spend changes, where works planned for 2009/10 will now be delivered in 2010/11, in respect of schemes including: - Pear Tree junction, Southport Parking signage, UTC upgrades, and Local Safety schemes.

4 Performance in 2009/10

- 4.1 Technical Services performance is shown in Annex C & D. Annex C shows old scheme Best Value Performance indicators 2007/8 to 2009/10, although there is no longer formal reporting of the national Best Value Performance Indicators (BVPIs), it

was agreed that the Department will continue to report and monitor on them as “local indicators”, as there are already processes and procedures in place to collect and collate the required data. Annex D This consists of the new National Performance Indicators relating to this Department for 2009/10 compared with a regional and national performance average where available.

5 On-going issues for later financial years

5.1 The Environment & Technical Services Directors and Planning and Economic Regeneration Director have identified a number of ongoing issues as a result of this Portfolio’s outturn position for 2009/10 as follows:

- i) The experiences of 2008/09 and 2009/10 fully demonstrated the susceptibility of parking income to external factors. The extremely poor weather over the tourist season and winter months as well as the impact of the economic recession resulted in reduced income levels compared to previous years. The Parking Service is continuing to provide reduced car parking charges as part of promotions to support a number of retail campaigns in the Borough. This is having an impact on income and there is now an expectation this will continue to support key retail periods throughout the year. Progress of this will be subject to the full evaluation of existing promotions with regard to the impact of increasing visitors to the centres, impact on parking income and any affects on delivering the transport policies of the Council. The impact of reduced income will initially be to defer the range of improvements to the service as set out in the 5-year Parking Plan approved by Cabinet in November 2008. If adverse weather conditions arise again in 2010/11 this will result in a further reduction in income. Such variations will be reported regularly through the budget monitoring process.
- ii) The progression of Traffic Regulation Orders is a key element of the service provided to maintain the Council’s Traffic Management Duty, i.e. to reduce delay and congestion on the highway, promote safety and improve access to businesses, public facilities etc. A key requirement is to advertise proposals in the local press. The move to a corporate approach to advertising has resulted in at least a doubling of cost, hence reducing the available funding to deliver traffic management improvements.
- iii) Following the Major Service Review the Department transferred its main income generating services to Capita Symonds. However a residual income target of £0.355m remains within the budget and cannot be achieved. This issue is currently being considered along with other items as part of a budget review and Members will be advised of this work in due course
- iv) An exercise was undertaken during 2009/10 to identify and reformat all Network Management income. As a result of this exercise Network Management achieved £309k income against a Budget Book target of £227k. Consequently it was agreed that the income target/prediction for Network Management could be raised to £320k. Within the 2010/11 Budget however this income target/prediction is now shown as £370k. Every effort will be made to maximise income, but as most of the income is generated by 3rd party activity entirely outside the Council's control there is a risk that this over-prediction of income will result in a budget shortfall

- v) Inflation has been allowed to cover the contractual increase due in the grounds maintenance contract but this does not take into account additional areas, which have been added to the contract as part of housing stock transfer for example. Certain landscaped areas were transferred back to the Council and now need to be maintained within the Grounds Maintenance Contract however no additional financial provision was made for this work. Whilst some Budget re-formatting has been possible there is still a shortfall in the region of £100k, further reformatting work is being investigated to attempt to reduce this shortfall further.
- vi) Works carried out by Client Team relating to Capital Works are levied against the Capital Programme. A reduction in Capital Programme results a reduced "levy" and under resourcing of Client Team. The actual shortfall in 2009/10 was £50k and with a further reduction in Capital schemes a shortfall in 2010/11 of at least £100k is anticipated. Likewise part of the revenue cost for work carried out in respect of Design, Drainage, Maintenance and Electrical Services is recovered by a levy against the Capital Programme - in 2009/10 this led to a £30k shortfall but with reduced activity in 2010/11 a £90k shortfall is now anticipated
- vii) The cold winters of 2008/9 and 2009/10 resulted in the annual budget for gritting of the highway, both carriageways and footways, to be overspent. The service is a statutory duty hence expenditure has to be incurred as required. A full review of the service will be completed prior to next winter, to assess the effectiveness of the service and take account of the latest conditions and needs.

6 Recommendations

6.1 The Cabinet Member is asked to:

- i) Note the Portfolio's revenue expenditure outturn for 2009/10;
- ii) Note the impact of the Portfolio's capital expenditure outturn for 2009/10;
- iii) Note the Portfolio's performance indicators and data for 2009/10; and
- iv) Consider whether, in the light of the comments made by the Technical Services Director, any issues should be referred to the Overview and Scrutiny Committee (Regeneration and Environmental) for consideration.

Annex A

**Technical Services
Final Accounts 2009/10 – Revenue Expenditure**

Ref. No.		ACTUALS 2008/09	REVISED ESTIMATE 2009/10	ACTUALS 2009/10
		£	£	£
	<u>SUMMARY</u>			
	Technical Services Department (Admin / Transport Development)	1,546,797	1,556,250	2,018,219
	Highways Management	17,616,073	15,337,400	14,462,874
	Agency Capita Symonds		1,289,950	1,404,693
	Tourism & Attractions Car Parking	0	1,550	0
	On - Street Parking	-703,526	-1,012,300	-774,740
	Off - Street Parking	91,668	-118,300	104,540
	School Crossing Patrols	438,663	502,450	491,547
	Merseyside Engineers Laboratory Service	15,782	0	4,866
	Vehicle Fleet Management/maintenance	-1,520	0	0
	TSD Front Page		-168,850	
	CPRS	69,167		
	Total Net Expenditure	19,073,104	17,388,150	17,711,999
	Section 74	-417,021		-289,116
	Car Parking Reserve	-90,000		
	Total Net Expenditure	18,566,083	17,388,150	17,422,883

METROPOLITAN BOROUGH OF SEFTON

CAPITAL PROGRAMME 2009/10 - 2012/13

TECHNICAL SERVICES

	2	3	4	5	6
REF. D.O.	PROJECT DESCRIPTION	TOTAL COST	REVISED ESTIMATE 2009/10	OUTTURN 2009/10	REPHASING TO 2010/11
		£'000	£'000	£'000	£'000
	New Construction				
	Thornton Switch Island Link Scheme (Council Contribution)	5,912.00	1,121.89	1,097.82	24.07
	Asset Management Development	69.10	0.00	0.00	0.00
	Carriageways / Priority Maintenance				
	A5090 Hawthorne Rd	1,995.58	206.63	209.41	-2.78
	Old & Completing Schemes	20.19	20.19	20.64	-0.45
	Carriageway Resurfacing				
	Islington, Crosby	109.00	109.00	109.79	-0.79
	Park Lane, Netherton	30.50	30.50	28.64	1.86
	Kirkstone Rd South, Litherland	70.50	70.50	71.46	-0.96
	Marine Drive, Southport	53.70	53.70	59.36	-5.66
	Sterrix Lane - Litherland	74.70	74.70	72.83	1.87
	Kendal Drive - Maghull	57.40	57.40	57.21	0.19
	Fairways - Crosby	15.20	15.20	15.15	0.05
	Mayfair Avenue - Crosby	33.70	33.70	33.64	0.06
	Bulwer Street - Bootle	48.60	48.60	48.61	-0.01
	Banastre Road - Southport	67.10	67.10	66.14	0.96
	2	3	4	5	6

REF. NO.	PROJECT DESCRIPTION	TOTAL COST	REVISED ESTIMATE 2009/10	OUTTURN 2009/10	REPHASING TO 2010/11
		£'000	£'000	£'000	£'000
5	Applbey Drive - Netherton	18.90	18.90	18.13	0.77
6	Greenheys Drive - Netherton	23.20	23.20	23.13	0.07
7	Harrowby Road - Seaforth	24.20	24.20	23.17	1.03
8	Woodlands Road - Seaforth	22.60	22.60	22.60	0.00
9	St Georges Grove - Netherton	11.70	11.70	11.78	-0.08
0	Altcar Lane - Formby 09/10 Schemes	64.20	64.20	64.01	0.19
1	Thackery Gardens - Litherland	39.20	39.20	57.46	-18.26
2	Prescot Road - Melling	39.00	39.00	38.82	0.18
3	Parkfield Avenue - Aintree	34.40	34.40	34.78	-0.38
4	Raymond Avenue - Aintree	22.50	22.50	23.67	-1.17
5	Abbeystead Avenue - Aintree	29.90	29.90	30.13	-0.23
6	Gately Drive - Maghull	9.90	9.90	9.92	-0.02
7	Yew Tree Green - Melling	9.70	9.70	9.51	0.19
8	Gregsons Avenue - Formby	10.80	10.80	10.69	0.11
9	Ecclesall Avenue - Litherland	30.30	30.30	30.28	0.02
0	Northway - Maghull	14.30	14.30	14.38	-0.08
1	Ridgeway Drive - Lydiate	19.30	19.30	19.63	-0.33
2	Matlock Avenue - Southport	12.60	12.60	12.53	0.07
3	Third Avenue - Crosby	8.80	8.80	8.50	0.30
4	Shellfield Rd, Southport	80.74	51.00	50.26	0.74
	2	3	4	5	6
		TOTAL	REVISED	OUTTURN	REPHASING

REF. NO.	PROJECT DESCRIPTION	COST	ESTIMATE 2009/10	2009/10	TO 2010/11
		£'000	£'000	£'000	£'000
UTC Maintenance					
5	Manchester Rd / Queens Rd Junction	50.00	50.00	71.95	-21.95
De Trunking					
6	A59 Damfield Lane to Northway	128.83	128.83	128.83	0.00
7	A565 Crosby Rd Sth/Princess Way/Cambridge Rd	463.96	463.96	445.30	18.66
8	A59 Switch Island / Kenyons Lane / The Alt	125.00	125.00	125.00	0.00
9	A570 Boundary to Kew	99.00	99.00	78.47	20.53
0	Capita Fees / Client Service Costs	134.53	134.53	135.59	-1.06
Street Lighting					
1	Marine Terrace, Waterloo	46.00	46.00	29.14	16.86
2	Aylward Place, Bootle	41.00	41.00	29.28	11.72
Drainage					
3	Scarisbrick New Rd Southport	60.00	60.00	58.42	1.58
4	A565 Liverpool Rd	218.00	218.00	236.29	-18.29
5	Wango Lane	83.70	83.70	91.48	-7.78
6	Capita Fees / Client Service Costs	55.00	55.00	28.72	26.28
Total Carriageways / Priority Maintenance		4,607.43	2,788.74	2,764.73	24.01

Bridges and Structures

Bridge Strengthening

7	Principal Bridge Inspections	66.00	33.00	63.77	-30.77
8	Assessment - Retaining Walls	1.00	1.00	0.00	1.00
9	Parapet Strengthening	105.00	30.00	29.51	0.49

2

3

4

5

6

REF. NO.	PROJECT	TOTAL COST	REVISED ESTIMATE	OUTTURN 2009/10	REPHASING TO
----------	---------	------------	------------------	-----------------	--------------

D.	DESCRIPTION	2009/10		2010/11	
		£'000	£'000	£'000	£'000
0	Network Rail Structures	6.00	6.00	0.00	6.00
1	Poverty Lane	153.40	110.02	110.04	-0.02
2	St. Lukes Rd Bridge Strengthening	1,190.44	630.00	635.28	-5.28
3	Millers Bridge	24.00	24.00	24.00	0.00
4	Old and Completing Schemes	586.59	6.09	4.09	2.00
5	Capita Fees / Client Service Costs	67.48	34.48	5.38	29.10
	Total Bridges and Structures	2,199.91	874.59	872.07	2.52
Integrated Transport Programme					
6	Current Schemes	21,890.13	2,942.31	2,176.35	765.96
Other Schemes					
7	Southport Cycle Town	823.00	636.43	645.72	-9.29
8	Southport Cycle Town - Coastal Rd to Ainsdale	250.00	250.00	124.18	125.82
9	Old and Completing Schemes	6.66	6.66	0.00	6.66
	Total Other Technical Services Schemes	1,079.66	893.09	769.90	123.19
Provision for New Starts - Subject to Report					
0	Block Allocations	1,760.31	0.00	0.00	0.00
	TOTAL TECHNICAL SERVICES SCHEMES	37,518.54	8,620.62	7,680.87	939.75

CF. D.	PROJECT DESCRIPTION	TOTAL COST	REVISED ESTIMATE 2009/10	OUTTURN 2009/10	REPHASING TO 2010/11
		£'000	£'000	£'000	£'000
	UTC Maintenance				
5	Manchester Rd / Queens Rd Junction	50.00	50.00	71.95	-21.95
	De Trunking				
6	A59 Damfield Lane to Northway	128.83	128.83	128.83	0.00
7	A565 Crosby Rd Sth/Princess Way/Cambridge Rd	463.96	463.96	445.30	18.66
8	A59 Switch Island / Kenyons Lane / The Alt	125.00	125.00	125.00	0.00
9	A570 Boundary to Kew	99.00	99.00	78.47	20.53
0	Capita Fees / Client Service Costs	134.53	134.53	135.59	-1.06
	Street Lighting				
1	Marine Terrace, Waterloo	46.00	46.00	29.14	16.86
2	Aylward Place, Bootle	41.00	41.00	29.28	11.72
	Drainage				
3	Scarisbrick New Rd Southport	60.00	60.00	58.42	1.58
4	A565 Liverpool Rd	218.00	218.00	236.29	-18.29
5	Wango Lane	83.70	83.70	91.48	-7.78
6	Capita Fees / Client Service Costs	55.00	55.00	28.72	26.28
	Total Carriageways / Priority Maintenance	4,607.43	2,788.74	2,764.73	24.01

Bridges and Structures

Bridge Strengthening

7	Principal Bridge Inspections	66.00	33.00	63.77	-30.77
8	Assessment - Retaining Walls	1.00	1.00	0.00	1.00
9	Parapet Strengthening	105.00	30.00	29.51	0.49

	2	3	4	5	6
EF. D.	PROJECT DESCRIPTION	TOTAL COST	REVISED ESTIMATE 2009/10	OUTTURN 2009/10	REPHASING TO 2010/11
		£'000	£'000	£'000	£'000
0	Network Rail Structures	6.00	6.00	0.00	6.00
1	Poverty Lane	153.40	110.02	110.04	-0.02
2	St. Lukes Rd Bridge Strengthening	1,190.44	630.00	635.28	-5.28
3	Millers Bridge	24.00	24.00	24.00	0.00
4	Old and Completing Schemes	586.59	6.09	4.09	2.00
5	Capita Fees / Client Service Costs	67.48	34.48	5.38	29.10
	Total Bridges and Structures	2,199.91	874.59	872.07	2.52
	Integrated Transport Programme				
6	Current Schemes	21,890.13	2,942.31	2,176.35	765.96
	Other Schemes				
7	Southport Cycle Town	823.00	636.43	645.72	-9.29
8	Southport Cycle Town - Coastal Rd to Ainsdale	250.00	250.00	124.18	125.82
9	Old and Completing Schemes	6.66	6.66	0.00	6.66
	Total Other Technical Services Schemes	1,079.66	893.09	769.90	123.19
0	Block Allocations	1,760.31	0.00	0.00	0.00
	TOTAL TECHNICAL SERVICES SCHEMES	37,518.54	8,620.62	7,680.87	939.75

Performance Indicators for the Technical Services Portfolio

OLD SCHEME BEST VALUE PERFORMANCE INDICATORS 2007/8 TO 2009/10

PI Ref.	Description	Sefton Actual 2007/8	Sefton Actual 2008/9	Sefton Actual 2009/10
99ai	Road accident casualties: KSI all people	100	87	100
99aai	Road accident casualties: KSI all people (% change over previous period)	6.4%	-13.0%	14.9
99aiii	Road accident casualties: KSI all people (% change over 1994-98 average)	-15.3%	-26.3%	-15.3%
99bi	Road accident casualties: KSI children	11	15	17
99bii	Road accident casualties: KSI children (% change over previous period)	-35.3%	36.4%	13.3%
99biii	Road accident casualties: KSI children (% change over 1994-98 average)	-54.2%	-37.5%	-29.2%
99ci	Road accident casualties: Slight injuries	979	887	829
99cii	Road accident casualties: Slight injuries (% change over previous period)	-12%	-9.4%	-6.5%
99ciii	Road accident casualties: Slight injuries (% change over 1994-98 average)	-32.5%	-38.9%	-42.99%
165	Pedestrian Crossings with Facilities for Disabled People	82.2%	62%	N/a
178	Footpaths and Rights of Way Easy to Use by Public	83.3%	64.1%	74.8%
187a	Condition of Surface Footway	8%	na	26%
215a	Rectification of Street Lighting Faults (non-DNO)	3.09 days	3.04 Days	2.87
215b	Rectification of Street Lighting Faults (DNO)	19.21 days	17.31 Days	16.5 Days
223	Condition of Principal Roads	5%	NI168	
224a	Condition of Non-Principal Roads	5%	NI169	
224b	Condition of unclassified roads	5%	na	6%

Although there is no longer formal reporting of the national Best Value Performance Indicators (BVPIs), it was agreed that the Department will continue to report and monitor on them as “local indicators”, as there are already processes and procedures in place to collect and collate the required data. While it may no longer be possible to compare results nationally, as there is no requirement for authorities to continue to report on any of the original set of BVPIs, the data may be adopted by future benchmarking groups, and could prove to be a useful gauge for historical comparisons. The table above shows the last 3 years of BVPI indicators relating to this Department.

FINAL ACCOUNT 2009/10 TECHNICAL SERVICES PORTFOLIO

Data Taken From the Places Analysis Tool (PAT)

Code	Name	Polarity	Actual 2009/10	PAT Regional Average	10% Variance	PAT National Average	10% Variance
NI 048	Children killed or seriously injured in road traffic accidents DfT DSO	Positive % change	-2.30 P				
NI 168	Principal roads where maintenance should be considered	Lower %	6	5	60.00%	5	60.00%
NI 169	Non-principal classified roads where maintenance should be considered	Lower %	5	6	16.67%	8	-12.50%
NI 176	Working age people with access to employment by public transport (and other specified modes)	Higher %		82	0.00%	82	0.00%
NI 186	Per capita reduction in CO2 emissions in the LA area	Lower %		4.4	-68.18%	3.9	-64.10%
NI 187A	Tackling fuel poverty – people receiving income based benefits living in homes with a low energy efficiency rating Defra DSO	Lower %	10	5	40.00%	10	-30.00%

Note: The above list of National Indicators may not include all indicators relevant to this Department, as items with 'Nil' actual values 2009/10 have been excluded